Removing Barriers to Postsecondary Success for Undocumented Students in Southern New Mexico

Magaly N. Lopez, Zahra Mojtahedi, Wanmeng Ren, Renata Turrent-Hegewisch | Public Policy, University of California, Los Angeles

Introduction
The DREAMer movement and President Obama’s response through executive action on Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) has brought national attention to outdated policies and institutional systems that limit educational opportunities for undocumented youth. As of 2014, there were approximately 11 million undocumented people living in the United States and an estimated 200,000 to 225,000 undocumented students enrolled in college. Nationally, undocumented students are significantly less likely than U.S. born citizens to complete high school and enroll in postsecondary education. Many students from immigrant backgrounds face a unique set of challenges in adapting to and persevering in college. For undocumented students, these challenges are often compounded by legal and financial barriers to accessing higher education. Many students encounter fear, the real day-to-day threat of deportation, and trauma as a result of challenges related to their immigration status.

This brief illustrates the need for greater resources and engagement on social equity and immigrant rights issues. It also highlights the role that government, community-based organizations, educational institutions, and foundations can play in removing barriers to postsecondary success for undocumented students, especially for those living in hostile environments. To better address an issue that is national in scope, this brief reports a regional case study of Southern New Mexico, with an emphasis on the needs of undocumented students at New Mexico State University (NMSU). We identify five major barriers contributing to postsecondary disparities in our case study: (1) minimal financial support, (2) misinformation or lack of information about attending college, (3) scarce legal support, (4) fear and isolation limiting social engagement, and (5) limited mental health support. The findings are adapted from a report that focused on identifying barriers facing undocumented students in New Mexico in achieving postsecondary success.
Background

New Mexico: State Context

As of 2012, there were an estimated 70,000 undocumented immigrants in New Mexico,\(^8\) 90\% of whom are Mexican-born immigrants.\(^9\) Among the unauthorized population, 47\% live below the federal poverty level,\(^10\) compared to the national average of 14.5\%.\(^11\) Moreover, New Mexico consistently ranks among the states with the lowest educational performance.\(^12\) The Migration Policy Institute estimates that only 14\% of undocumented adults 25 years and older have completed at least some college, with only 5\% having obtained a bachelor’s degree or higher.\(^13\) Uniform federal legislation to make postsecondary education not just possible but financially feasible does not yet exist. In its absence, some states have implemented laws to allow for in-state tuition, and in some cases, access to state-level aid and scholarships.\(^14\)

State-level Policies

New Mexico is one of the few states that provide financial benefits to undocumented students. In 2005, New Mexico passed S.B. 582, outlawing the denial of admission or access to state-funded educational benefits based on a student’s immigration status.\(^15\) Undocumented students in New Mexico may qualify for both in-state tuition and state-level financial aid.\(^16\)

A primary source of state financial support for undergraduates, including those with unauthorized status, is New Mexico’s Legislative Lottery Scholarship.\(^17\) Though recent announcements about funding level decreases leave its fiscal future uncertain,\(^18\) the Lottery Scholarship provides partial tuition support to some eligible students who attend a public community college or four-year university immediately after earning a high school diploma or GED.\(^19\)

Institutional Context

New Mexico State University (NMSU), which is the focus of our study, is the largest college in Southern New Mexico.\(^20\) It includes the four-year university main campus in Las Cruces along with four community college branch campuses offering academic, technical, and continuing education (see Figure 1).\(^21\)

We find the University of New Mexico (UNM) to be a useful point of comparison to NMSU.\(^22\) As one of the most prominent universities in the state, UNM shares important similarities with NMSU: both are public institutions serving as regional hubs of learning with large student enrollments and comparable in-state tuition fees.\(^23\) However, UNM and NMSU differ in important ways; namely, UNM has implemented programs for undocumented students while support services at NMSU have remained very minimal.
Major Findings

The following section identifies and describes (1) a set of socio-political environmental factors specific to Southern New Mexico, and (2) five major barriers to postsecondary persistence and success for undocumented students. This research informs the policy recommendations to follow.
1. Socio-Political Environmental Factors Affecting Student Success

Regional Background

Many of the state’s resource capacities are located in Bernalillo County (central NM). Bernalillo County contains Albuquerque, which is the largest city and home to over a quarter of the state’s population. It is also the base of operations for the major organizations at the forefront of immigrant rights struggles in the state. Las Cruces and the surrounding areas, on the other hand, appear to contain fewer community-based organizations (CBOs). Some CBOs have been carrying out organizing, labor and immigrant rights work for decades. However, based on our findings, they appear to be operating on a less protrusive scale than those in Central New Mexico.

![Figure 2: Geography and population distribution in New Mexico. Source: Authors.](image)

Hostile Atmosphere, Geographic Immobility and Fear

Given Southern New Mexico’s proximity to the US-Mexico border, there is an increased presence of U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE), which may affect community mobilization around a broad spectrum of issues affecting the immigrant community.
Las Cruces sits within the 100-mile border zone, which allows for border enforcement operations, such as checkpoints, to be conducted far beyond the border and ports of entry. Figure 2 illustrates the geographic constraints created by the checkpoint located just 10 miles north of Las Cruces. Surrounded by a national border and with only two major highways crossing the state, an undocumented person is likely to be confined to the southern-most region and may be geographically restricted from accessing resources available in Albuquerque and the state’s capital, Santa Fe.

Interviewees referred to living within these geographic constraints as life in a cage. One of the primary explanations interviewees offered for refraining from engaging in civic activities was to minimize the risk of revealing their status and the subsequent legal repercussions. One such student explains how his daily activities are hindered by border patrol presence:

“Moving here, I could tell that my parents, they didn’t like going out even when I would ask them if we could go to the store so I could buy something, they were really careful about it and they didn’t like going out unless we had a specific reason because obviously that could be the last time... I mean, something bad will happen just by going across the street.”

According to our interviewees, efforts have been made to engage the immigrant community but have often failed to gain momentum. The visible presence of border patrol and law enforcement agencies may be contributing to a suppressed state of civic engagement among undocumented students and their families.

**Limited Student Engagement**

Our research indicates that NMSU has relatively few student organizations advocating for social justice or immigrant rights issues and none that overtly advocate for undocumented student issues. In contrast, many undocumented students at UNM who are engaged with El Centro de la Raza and student organizations like the DREAM Team are often open and vocal, not only about their status but also other related social justice issues. Many students indicate feeling proud and eager to advocate for undocumented peoples’ rights and benefit from the peer support they receive:

“Knowing that I am not alone and having the support of other students facing similar problems has helped me to adapt and succeed in school.”

Additionally, the UNM DREAM Team participates in national advocacy efforts with United We Dream, a national organization guiding the student-led immigrants’ rights movement. Locally, they serve as an important liaison between the immigrant community and legal service providers by organizing DACA clinics. Conversely, undocumented students at NMSU lack such support structures and, on average, appear to be less comfortable disclosing their status.

**Limited Administrative Support**

Educational institutions can be intimidating to undocumented students because they fear legal repercussions if their status is recorded at school. Often, students perceive administrators as an extension of government entities and are hesitant to trust them. For instance, students may be asked to reveal their immigration status or that of their parents during the college enrollment process. Several interviewees shared that when they submitted their college applications, they left the space for a social security number blank and were subsequently asked by administrative offices to complete the application in-person and in some cases were inappropriately questioned.
Misinformed staff can deter students from pursuing higher education in the initial stages of college enrollment. It is unknown whether the actions reported were intentional or not. Regardless, our findings suggest that front line staff sometimes do not know how best to proceed with student applications and inquiries. While some of the students interviewed emphasized their own role as self-advocates for their education in the absence of better administrative support, respondent accounts highlight the importance of high school and college counselors, staff, teachers, and other mentors who help students stay informed on their legal protections and postsecondary options as undocumented students.

Some supportive activities were identified at NMSU but they were limited in scope. NMSU does not have a program with an explicit mission of serving undocumented students, however it does have a campus-based resource center called Chicano Programs where undocumented students can begin the process of enrollment. Chicano Programs also houses an Immigrant Student Issues Committee, which was established to provide information to undocumented students on laws that affect them and resources they may have access to. A handful of campus administrators were identified among interviewees as working actively to maintain student confidentiality and support them in navigating scarcely available resources. While campus allies exist, they are also limited by the overall hostile climate. As one student from Southern New Mexico notes:

“I’m a very cautious person. I don’t trust anyone. I would send out emails just hinting at things and seeing if the person would react to it. Maybe it was just luck, but I got to talking with someone who’s very sympathetic and they helped me through the process and they coded me into the system. There were people that either they didn’t know or they could have become antagonistic, but that person was able to help just get things straight.”

Limited Opportunities for Community Engagement

Since undocumented families are largely ineligible for government services and are often disengaged from civic affairs due to a fear of exposure, community-based organizations (CBOs) play an essential role in providing both resources and opportunities for civic participation.

By some accounts, the undocumented student movement in Santa Fe and Albuquerque originated from a group of high school students who were not allowed to park in their campus parking lot because permits were only issued with drivers’ licenses and undocumented persons were ineligible per state laws at the time. A local advocacy organization helped the students gain access to the student parking lot at the high school and, as a result, many of those students joined the CBO’s successful campaigning efforts for state drivers’ licenses for all, playing an essential role in increasing community participation. Many of those same students moved on to lead efforts in college to build the undocumented student movement at Santa Fe Community College (SFCC) and at UNM. Moreover, the culture of partnership between student groups and CBOs continues to play an important role in information dissemination on DACA qualification and application services in Albuquerque.

In contrast, the landscape of CBOs in Southern New Mexico does not currently exhibit a political or social climate conducive to civic participation. Although some CBO activity is present, overall, community engagement has not captured student involvement to the same extent as in Central New Mexico.
2. Major Barriers to Undocumented Student Success

This section describes the five major barriers to postsecondary success for undocumented students in Southern New Mexico identified in our study: (1) minimal financial support, (2) misinformation or lack of information about attending college, (3) scarce legal support, (4) fear and isolation limiting social engagement, and (5) limited mental health support.

Financial support is minimal, yet most needed

In New Mexico, undocumented students have access to in-state tuition and state financial benefits, however, federal grants, work-study programs and loans are not available to undocumented students, including DACA recipients. Despite being eligible for in-state tuition, students are not able to access work-study benefits because the funds are derived from both state and federal funds. Since the funds cannot be clearly differentiated, students are not granted work-study opportunities to prevent violations of federal law. As previously mentioned, undocumented students are more likely to be living in poverty, therefore, their parental contributions are generally expected to be limited. While DACA recipients may have a slight advantage because they are eligible to work, the majority of undocumented students are left to rely on the limited availability of private scholarships to fund their cost of attendance. However, most scholarship opportunities have legal permanent residency or citizenship eligibility requirements and those that don’t are highly competitive.

Information on college is largely absent

Undocumented students finishing high school in Southern New Mexico generally receive limited tailored information, if any, about the college application process and their financial aid options. Some of the potential contributing explanations for the information gap include geographic separation from resource centers, unaccepting attitudes towards undocumented immigrants, and confusion about eligibility requirements and available resources (e.g. due to language barriers). Relatedly, limited legal services and advocacy efforts for immigrants in Southern New Mexico may be restricting the community’s ability to learn about its legal and educational rights.

Legal support is scarce

Legal barriers can be thought of as both the barriers that undocumented immigrant status imposes and the barriers stemming from restrictive state and institutional policies, such as restrictions on work-study opportunities. This section focuses on the need for legal support related to immigration status, specifically exploring the role of DACA.

Studies have found that DACA students are more likely to express aspirations to obtain an advanced degree. From our qualitative findings, we learned that some students became more engaged in student and community activist efforts when they became DACA recipients. Furthermore, we learned that legal services and advocacy efforts are limited in Southern New Mexico, which restricts the community’s ability to learn about their eligibility for programs like DACA.

Nationally, 25% of those who qualify for DACA have not yet applied, however interviewees shared that they believe the proportion is higher in the South than in Central New Mexico, partly due to a lack of awareness. Although there are a handful of local organizations working with the immigrant community in Southern New Mexico, only one organization was found in all of Las Cruces to offer legal assistance related to DACA. Last year, a group of local CBOs, high school teachers, higher education staff and...
volunteers, collaborated with community leaders and legal representatives in Albuquerque and organized a DACA clinic in Las Cruces. Despite widespread advertisement and some expressed public enthusiasm, only one family attended. Event organizers speculated that poor attendance was due to lack of trust and fear of border enforcement raids. Therefore, while DACA may generally allow undocumented students to more fully participate in college and in society, our study indicates that improving the socio-political climate and increasing legal support are priorities for improving postsecondary access.

Isolation and fear negatively impact social engagement

Undocumented youth are likely to lack a sense of belonging which may be exacerbated in the geographic context of Southern New Mexico. In border areas, increased levels of fear represent an additional barrier to social engagement. Identity formation, an important factor in determining educational success, is often disrupted for undocumented youth because they cannot fully partake in many rites of passage in young adulthood (e.g. finding a first job), making the transition to college a challenging time.

Interviewees shared how their levels of social belonging influenced their academic success and political engagement. Students in Central New Mexico consistently reflected on the difficulty of transitioning to college and how finding a sense of community on campus marked a turning point in their academic achievements. Student groups, mentors and community leaders were identified as having contributed to a sense of social engagement and belonging. However, such a sense of belonging was not a prominent theme in interviews conducted in the South, where students do not appear to be as politically or socially engaged. Our analysis reveals this may be due to the increased levels of fear, discrimination, and hostility in the area.

Status-related trauma and limited mental health support

Immigration status is associated with negative mental health outcomes such as stress, anxiety, depression, and a sense of isolation, as undocumented students experience additional forms of psychological distress compared to other immigrant students. Many college students may not be comfortable seeking mental health services due to the stigmatization of mental illness. Undocumented students face added stigma surrounding their immigration status and may not necessarily be comfortable seeking services out of fear the provider may put them at risk of deportation.

The fact that students rarely disclose their immigration status at NMSU is partly a response to feeling a lack of safety and encouragement to process the trauma associated with being undocumented. Several interviewees expressed feeling constant anxiety and isolation because of their immigration status. Many students also disclosed a persistent fear of themselves or their parents being deported. One UNM student shared:

“I wish we could have more spaces where we could share our stories and process the trauma”

While mental health resources are available through on-campus counseling at NMSU and off-campus within the Las Cruces region, the extent to which providers have the training, familiarity, and sensitivity to serve undocumented students is unclear. The aforementioned issues negatively affect the mental health of undocumented students and, without adequate availability of resources to cope, may put them at further disadvantage.
Recommendations

Higher education institutions working to improve undocumented student performance participate in a wide range of activities, from establishing resource centers to providing online resources for undocumented students. A recent UCLA study reveals as many as 73% of undocumented students with access to campus support services report taking advantage of them.61

From our research we learned that a combination of a positive campus climate, ally support among faculty and staff, and community-level support helped student movements gain traction in demanding better support systems. Therefore, institutional, community, and policy change are critical to empowering undocumented students and the broader community. We suggest higher education institutions, foundations and community-based organizations take integrative actions to better fulfill the needs of undocumented students.

Higher Education Institutions

- Create an on-campus center or program to provide a comprehensive set of services that help address the major barriers facing undocumented students
- Provide innovative financial support, such as student emergency grants, book lending programs, and incremental payment plans, to undocumented students
- Support and train faculty and staff on how to better serve undocumented students and launch initiatives to encourage a more “undocu-friendly” atmosphere (e.g. encourage university personnel to display safe zone placards in their workspace and common areas)
- Create a mentorship program where undocumented students can obtain academic guidance, personal development and career advice through communication and interaction with mentors
- Ensure campus-based mental health providers have adequate professional and cultural competence to serve undocumented students

Foundations

- Provide incentive grants to higher education institutions and CBOs that engage in self-assessment and demonstrate a willingness and capacity to better serve undocumented students
- Endorse grassroots student movements and leadership development through student fellowship opportunities
- Strengthen ongoing efforts to conduct legal clinics in Southern New Mexico by supporting current organizers and inviting outside facilitators when beneficial (e.g. the UNM Dream Team)
- Advocate for state-level policy changes based on a careful examination of state politics and policymaking dynamics. For example, supporting state work-study reform and creating a state-wide “FAFSA” process for DREAMers so that institutions may better assess financial need

Community-Based Organizations

- Organize legal clinics that provide DACA eligibility prescreening, document review, free attorney consultations and other individualized legal services in the community
- Invite outside activists and organize media events in Las Cruces to draw state and national attention to local campaigns and causes
• Conduct high school outreach to inform undocumented students about their postsecondary options and connect college students and high school students through tutoring and mentorship
• Provide virtual services such as online resource center or mobile apps that can help undocumented students stay informed and navigate educational resources, while ensuring safety from immigration status exposure

Important Considerations

While not explored in this report, academic obstacles are important to address. Though many undocumented students are raised speaking English, others may require additional language support.\textsuperscript{64} Furthermore, academic mentorship could be impactful, yet is often missing for undocumented students. Several undocumented students in our study shared that they do not have friends or family members that are familiar with the academic system in the U.S. to guide them through a successful academic career.

Our analysis reveals that further attention should be paid to the community college and high school setting. Community colleges are the main gateway to postsecondary education for undocumented students\textsuperscript{65} and based on our interview data, have a critical role to take on in improving services and information provided to undocumented students. Multiple interviewees also pointed to high school outreach as being critical to reducing misinformation and expanding college opportunity.

The policy problem described above is also inherently complex; a nuanced understanding that the undocumented community is not monolithic is critical to progress. For example, not all undocumented students are Latinas/os, which calls for an understanding of other cultures and demographic backgrounds in the undocumented community. Those who identify as LGBT also face a unique set of challenges in terms of discrimination and risk of hate violence.\textsuperscript{66} Organizations that operate based on an understanding of the complexities of identity intersectionality have an important role to play in supporting the undocumented community.

Conclusion

In the long-term, comprehensive federal immigration reform is key to addressing the barriers we have identified in this report. In the meantime and to that end, educational institutions, foundations, and community-based organizations can have important and complimentary roles to play in shaping policies, expanding resources, and further supporting the needs of undocumented students, particularly those in hostile environments.

It is especially critical that undocumented students and their families, who are most directly impacted by advocacy efforts and policy changes, be incorporated into organizational decision-making and planning efforts. Undocumented students, as organizers and leaders on the frontlines of pushing for change on their campuses and in their communities, have important expertise and wisdom that should be respected, solicited and accounted for when designing and implementing programs and investing in opportunities, such as those outlined in this report.
References


http://www.census.gov/hhes/www/poverty/about/overview/.
21 The community college branch campuses include Alamogordo, Carlsbad, Grants, and Dona Ana Community College (which is the community college branch adjacent to NMSU’s main campus).
22 The most prominent program models have been identified as UCLA, UC Berkeley and the UT Austin (Source: UndocuScholars Research Team. "In the Shadows of the Ivory Tower: Undocumented Undergraduates and the Liminal State of Immigration Reform." the Institute for Immigration, Globalization, and Education, 2015.) We were not able to identify any public 4-year campuses within undocumented student-specific programs within the 100-mile border zone with similar environmental context that could have served as a better point of comparison than UNM; University of Texas El Paso (UTEP) would have been the closest match in terms of regional context but lacks a robust set of programs supporting undocumented students.
28 Interview by author(s) of related study. August 2014.
Established in 1969, El Centro de la Raza is a campus-based center at UNM, targeting Latina/o students, which provides a wide range of leadership development, internship, scholarship, and mentorship resources and opportunities.


Interview by author(s) of related study, September 2014


Interview by authors, January 2015.

Interview by author(s) of related study, August 2014.


A smart phone application (i.e. Pocket DACA) has been developed to help the general public find access to information and resources related to DACA, nationally.


Interview by authors. January 2015.

Interview by authors. January 2015.


CAMP (College Assistance Migrant Program) is a federally funded program which has by some accounts demonstrated significant achievement in improving student retention and success for migrant or seasonal farm worker students. CAMP was mentioned by administrative and student interviewees on multiple occasions as having potential to support undocumented students, however, undocumented students are not eligible to participate in CAMP as it’s a federal program (Source: Interview by authors, January, 2015)

Innovative payment plan for undocumented students can be a program that allows students to make several payments throughout the term while maintaining full access to campus resources. (Source: Chen, Angela. "Undocumented Students, Institutional Allies, and Transformative Resistance: An Institutional Case Study". Dissertation, Department of Education, UCLA, 2013)

